

Advisory Committee on Standards for Voting Technologies

Committee Meeting

Meeting Minutes

July 18, 2023, 9:00am – 10:19 am

Microsoft Teams

Committee Attendees:

- Jean-Pierre Kingsley, Committee Chair
- Dr. Mkabi Walcott, CEO Appointee
- Dr. Nicole Goodman, CEO Appointee
- Michael Crase, Political Party Appointee – Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario
- Dan Duncan, Political Party Appointee – Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario
- Donald Eady, Political Party Appointee – New Democratic Party of Ontario
- Karla Webber-Gallagher, Political Party Appointee – New Democratic Party of Ontario
- Milton Chan, Political Party Appointee – Ontario Liberal Party
- Craig Cantin, Political Party Appointee – Green Party of Ontario
- Fiona Mackintosh, Executive Director of the Advisory Committee
- Mike Stockfish, Assistant Executive Director of the Advisory Committee
- Shikha Devgun, Project Manager for the Advisory Committee
- Danjeza Danglli, Policy & Strategic Planning Advisor for the Advisory Committee
- Jennifer MacLean, Administrative Assistant for the Advisory Committee

Guests: None

Opening Remarks and CEO Appointee Comments

- The Chair, Jean-Pierre Kingsley, outlined the agenda.
- The Chair noted that the purpose of this meeting is to provide specific feedback on sections of the Final Report and to identify any gaps.
- In addition, the Advisory Committee members are to discuss and provide feedback on other recommendations from the June 29th meeting.
- The June 29th meeting minutes were adopted.

Briefing on the Sections of the Final Report

- The Executive Director provided a briefing on the contents of the Final Report including:
 - The importance of the Final Report as a historic document.
 - Topics discussed in the literature review such as:
 - The standards drafting processes of the Election Assistance Commission and Council of Europe; and
 - Relevant Canadian legal cases.
 - The Executive Director provided an overview of the Methodology section.
 - The Executive Director instructed ACSVT Members to provide an updated biography for the Final Report.

Member Roundtable: Report Feedback on the Draft Sections of the Final Report

- Members requested the following changes to the Final Report:
 - Modifications to the Terms and Definitions section on terms “voting technology”, “election technology”, and “tabulator”;
 - Modifications to the background on the use of voting technology; and,
 - Modifications to the ACSVT member biographies.
- The Executive Director suggested:
 - Revising the definition of “voting technology”;
 - Revising the definition of “election technology” and removing it from the product standards; and,
 - Including an explanatory note in the appendix for the terms “voting technology” and “election technology”.
- Chair suggested revising the definition of “voting technology” into a broader legal term.

ACSVT Review and Approval of Other Recommendations

- **Recommendation #1:** Establish responsibility for an oversight body for the Product and Management Standards.
 - The Committee agreed that an oversight body is necessary to review and update future iterations of Standards as technology continues to evolve.
 - Members proposed a governance structure and recommended participants/authorities, including an ongoing role for political party participation, to develop and contribute to a permanent oversight body that would take ownership of and regularly update the Product and Management Standards.
- **Recommendation #2:** Establish and maintain a Vendor Registration Program to cover vendor corporate governance issues related to Engineering Lifecycle security. (Previously approved).
 - The Executive Director discussed the issues around the Engineering Lifecycle relating to corporate governance and the security of the human supply chain and reminded members of the recommendation previously approved.
 - CEO appointee recommended adding a recommendation to continually assess the voters list management system.
- **Recommendation #3:** Elections Ontario should assess the Permanent Register of Electors for Ontario (PREO) to ensure that it continues to adequately protect the accuracy and integrity of elector data at both the provincial and municipal levels.
 - The Advisory Committee discussed the reference to Bill 204 and the role of Elections Ontario in protecting the security and integrity of electoral data and processes.
 - The Advisory Committee and Chair suggested that Elections Ontario continue to conduct consultations with municipalities about protecting electors list data.
- **Recommendation #4:** The Legislative Assembly of Ontario should consider amending the municipal election legislation to direct municipalities to comply with the Standards, as adopted by Elections Ontario, when using vote tabulators and/or electronic poll books.
 - A discussion was had between the Chair and Executive Director to clarify that the intention of this recommendation is for Ontario municipalities to follow the same sets of standards in their use of voting technologies.
 - ACSVT agreed to keep this recommendation in the report.

- **Recommendation #5:** Elections Ontario should proactively offer to provide optional advisory support to municipalities in the use of vote tabulators and electronic poll books and continue with their current lending program.
 - Committee members agreed with the recommendation to provide support to municipalities.
 - The Chair shared insights about the experience of municipalities and suggested that municipalities use the Management and Product Standards as reference documents.
- **Recommendation #6:** The Legislative Assembly of Ontario should amend the *Election Act* to allow Risk Limiting Audits.
 - Committee members agreed to this recommendation which would change legislation to allow Risk Limiting Audits which would enhance of the integrity of the electoral process.

Upcoming Milestones

1. Advisory Committee members were provided the following information about the Product Standards:

- An overview of dispositioning comments from the public review period;
- Updated Standards to be brought forward to the Technical Committee in July;
- An additional Technical Committee meeting will be required; and,
- A full briefing will be brought to the Committee in the coming months.

2. Advisory Committee members were provided the following information about the Management Standard:

- Management Standard has been circulated to the Technical Committee for a two-week review; and,
- Briefing on their comments and revised Management Standard draft will be provided to the Committee in the coming months.

3. Advisory Committee members were provided the following information about the Final Report:

- Next draft of the Final Report is tracking to the Committee for the next meeting.

Closing Remarks

- The Executive Director adopted changes to sections in the Final Report as discussed during this meeting and agreed to prepare another draft including additional sections for the next meeting.

[The meeting of the Advisory Committee adjourned at 10:19 a.m.]